

## **Summary**

**of the thesis titled  
“Methodology of adaptation the best international practices  
of bilingual education to the condition of Kazakhstani trilingual education”  
by Zhuman Altynay Kanatkyzy  
submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph. D.),  
in specialty 6D011900 - Foreign language: two foreign languages**

### **Relevance of the research.**

Improving the quality of education and ensuring its accessibility for all is the fourth of the seventeen sustainable development goals [5]. Education is the key to the success of not only an individual, but also of entire communities, endless in their diversity. Recognition and acceptance of cultural identity of each of them seem to be the most pressing problem in the interaction of communities in the modern world. In this sense, without strong partnerships between people and countries, achieving all global goals of sustainable development is not possible. It is no coincidence the seventeenth goal declares “Partnership for Sustainable Development” [6]. Cooperation presupposes not only mutually beneficial, but also expedient exchange of experience in various spheres of society. It is no coincidence that a number of government documents defining the main directions of development of the education and science system note the importance of compliance with the best world practices [7-8]. Scientific and pedagogical community of Kazakhstan has positive attitude to the experience of others. Thereby there are particular risks of their adaptation, connected mainly with mechanical transformation and uncritical borrowings. It is enough to mention credit technology implemented to the higher education system. It took several years to understand and realize its features related to the choice and construction of students’ individual educational trajectory, the nature of monitoring class attendance, the absence of academic groups, etc.

In other words, many innovations implemented today in the Kazakh education system are of foreign origin. At the same time, the strategies and mechanisms for their adaptation to the socio-cultural conditions of the country and the specifics of the national education system are not always clear. The situation is similar in language education. In particular, the ideas of trilingual education have gone through a difficult path of acceptance and understanding by the general public, especially by parents of schoolchildren

Kazakhstan has proclaimed openness as one of the main principles of international interaction. First of all, it is implemented in language policy, according to which all languages of Kazakhstan people are defined as a national treasure [9].

To increase competitiveness and grow the export potential of the educational sector, the state decided to gradually switch to English as the language of instruction in high school and universities, which are indicated in the “Plan of the Nation - 100 concrete steps: a modern state for all” (step 79) [10]. At the same time, the promotion of the English language is based on the principles of trilingual education, the main idea of which is that the Kazakh language, the state language of Kazakhstan, is in the top of the language triangle [11-12]. The implementation of trilingual education is carried out through the level acquisition of Kazakh, Russian and foreign languages. Along with the level principle of teaching languages, priorities today are given to the communicative approach while reasonably preserving the grammatical approach. But bilingual education is a particularly important didactic tool in mastering several languages is. Let us add that bilingual education fundamentally contains ideas for developing students’ skills to build communications, interact with others, and work in a team. In this regard, they completely align with the abilities that the World Economic Forum suggests having for a prosperous life in the twenty-first century [13].

The development of bilingual education has sufficiently high level in foreign science. This is evidenced by the results of a bibliometric analysis of works available in the international databases Web of Science and Scopus. We found that over the past ten years, out of more than 2,000 works, about 1,000 for each base were published by US scientists, and Spain is in the second place. Kazakh scientists published 11 articles on each database (22 scientific articles in total). A more detailed study of scientific works showed that scientists consider bilingual education in terms of its historical development in different countries, from the standpoint of identifying the factors of its formation, classifying the types of bilingual education programs, and revealing the social significance of the formation of bilinguals. In general, a number of researchers in this area (Baker K., Galskova N.D., Gez N.I., Aliev R., Kazhe N., Shcherba L.V., Cook V.J., Titone R., Genesee F. and etc.) view bilingual education as an educational scheme in which the child gains knowledge of at least two languages, one of which is the native language of some or all children in the class, and the second language, as a rule, is the language of wider communication, often the official or state language.

Returning to the issues of international experience exchange, we note, that bilingual education in the context of adaptation best world practice to the condition of one or another educational system is studied not enough in pedagogical science.

In general, studying the problem of adapting the best practices of bilingual education to the educational conditions of Kazakhstan allowed us to establish the **following contradictions** between:

- the need to apply the best world experience in bilingual education and the insufficiency of methodological support for its adaptation to the conditions of Kazakhstan trilingual education;

- the demand for methodological support for adapting the best world experience in bilingual education and the practical absence of pedagogical strategies and mechanisms for such adaptation.

Based on these contradictions, **a research problem** was identified, which is to find answers to the following questions: “How to determine the best world experience in bilingual education? What are its criteria?”, “What is the methodology for applying the best world experience in bilingual education?”, “What are the pedagogical strategies and mechanisms for adapting the best world experience in bilingual education to the conditions of Kazakhstani education?” The identified problem became the determining factor in choosing the topic of the dissertation research, which is presented in the following edition: “Methodology for adapting the best world experience of bilingual education to the conditions of Kazakhstan trilingual education.”

**The object of the research** is adaptation of the best world experience of bilingual education in the context of trilingual education.

**The subject of the research** is pedagogical strategies and mechanisms for adapting the best world experience in bilingual education.

**The aim of the research** is scientific substantiation and development of pedagogical strategies and mechanisms for adapting the best world experience of bilingual education to the conditions of the Kazakh trilingual education system.

**Research hypothesis:** adaptation of the best world experience of bilingual education to the conditions of the Kazakh school education system will be successful provided that a system of pedagogical strategies and mechanisms is developed and applied, built on the basis of identifying the acceptability and relevance of a particular fragment of this experience, the validity of which is ensured through the development of evaluation criteria and the selection of the most successful foreign countries in this matter, since the principle of critical borrowing is observed as a guarantor of a positive impact on the adaptable environment.

Based on the purpose and hypothesis of the study, the **following tasks** were identified:

- 1) to reveal the essence of the world's best bilingual education experience;
- 2) to identify the best world experience in bilingual education;
- 3) to determine the methodological basis for adapting the phenomenon being studied;
- 4) to develop pedagogical strategies and mechanisms for adapting the best world experience of bilingual education to the conditions of Kazakhstani education;
- 5) to conduct practical verification of the developed pedagogical strategies and adaptation mechanisms of the phenomenon being studied.

**The methodological basis of the study was made up of works devoted to:**

- the problem of foreign language, multilingual, trilingual education (Kunanbaeva S.S., Zhetpisbaeva B.A., José Manuel Vez V.J. Cook, M. Clyne, L.M. Malykh, A.V. Zhukov, etc.), which allowed us understand the basic concepts of modern language education, and also take as the starting position the understanding of language education as a leading factor in quality education in general;

- issues of bilingual education (C. Baker, F. Genesee and K. Lindholm-Leary, J. F. Hamers, M. Blanc, R. Aliev, N. Kazhe, L. V. Shcherba, Cheryl A. Roberts, O. García, G. Kadyrzhanova, D. Abdrakhmanova), who confirmed our opinion that the parallel study of several non-native languages is based on knowledge of the native language;

- problems of adapting the experience of others (E. Durkheim, L.V. Korel, A.A. Ershov, L.F. Burlachuk, A.A. Rean, A.R. Kudashev, A.A. Baranov, T. Parsons, V.Terziev, J.W. Berry), which allowed us to understand that adaptation is most effective and adequate if we choose not the entire foreign educational system, but only its certain correlated fragment;

- issues of methodological support in the field of education (N.V. Bordovskaya, V.A. Slastenin, V.P. Kashirin, L.P. Krivshenko, M.E. Weindorf, J. Piaget, L. Vigotsky), when we focus our attention on the methodology of practical activities in our work;

- issues of motivation in language learning (R.C. Gardner, W.E. Lambert, D. Zoltán, Deci, L.Edward, M. Richard, etc.).

### **Research methods.**

To solve the first and third problems, methods of theoretical analysis of scientific works, systematization, structuring and classification, visualization using the VosViewer bibliometric analysis program, interpretation of scientific provisions, and the method of independent examination were used.

To solve the second problem, methods of systematic and comparative analysis of the results of international studies (PISA, TIMSS, PIRLS, TALIS, as well as GIC), methods of criterial, retrospective and comparative analysis, methods of interpretation and generalization of the data obtained were used.

To solve the fourth problem, methods of conceptualization, pedagogical design and modeling of pedagogical systems were used.

To solve the fifth problem, methods of testing, survey, questioning and interviewing, objectification of subjective opinions, collection and systematization, as well as mathematical processing of statistical data were used.

The reliability and validity of the results obtained are ensured by the compliance of the **research methods** indicated above with the assigned tasks. In the course of solving problems based on the use of adequate methods, intermediate research results were consistently obtained.

### **The scientific novelty and theoretical significance of the research are:**

- a system of criteria for assessing the best world experience in bilingual education was developed for the first time in domestic pedagogy;

- based on the obtained criteria, the most successful experience of bilingual education was determined and pedagogical strategies and mechanisms for its adaptation to the conditions of the Kazakh trilingual education system were developed.

Thus, the significance of the obtained results is determined by the fact that the adaptation of successful practices in bilingual education should be based on criterion-based assessment.

**The practical significance of the work** lies in the fact that in the real practice of school education it is possible to apply a program for developing students' motivation in learning non-native languages, developed by us in accordance with the subscales and criteria of the MSLQ questionnaire (Motivated Strategies for Learning Questionnaire) as one of the fragments of the experience of the most successful countries in bilingual education.

#### **Main provisions submitted for defense.**

Bilingual education as one of the world's educational trends has not got only a solid history (it dates back to the 19th century), but also a high degree of development in science. At the same time, there is a progressive growth in the works of scientists studying various aspects and facets of this phenomenon. Today in science, bilingual education in the most general context is considered as the use of two languages in teaching, which has a fairly wide range of strong and weak forms, from Mainstream with foreign language teaching to language immersion.

To identify the best world experience in bilingual education, we initiated the development of criteria for its evaluation. In this case, the starting position was the understanding of the criteria as "... the reference value of the optimal answer to the question posed or solution to the problem...". Based on this interpretation, we proposed as such criteria: international recognition, sustainability, efficiency and adaptability. The first criterion means a positive, collective assessment of experts approved by the general public, justified through the use of reliable diagnostic tools. As such assessments, we accepted the results of international comparative studies GIK, PISA, TIMSS, PIRLS, TALIS, PIAAC. The second criterion means the ability of any system to maintain its properties and qualities over time. Therefore, in the context of our study, we explain the sustainability of experience as the positive dynamics of the results of the above international studies by several cycles, starting in 2017. The third criterion implies a positive correlation coefficient of the TIMSS, PISA, PIRLS, TALIS indicators with the GIC and PIAAC indicators, since: firstly, the GCI determines the rating of the competitiveness of national economies, among the indicators of which education indicators occupy a significant place; secondly, PIAAC assesses the competencies of those adults who participated in TIMSS, PISA, PIRLS studies during their school years. The fourth criterion means the correlation between the experiences of the adapting and transmitting countries.

Based on these criteria, which received a positive opinion from independent experts, as well as an understanding of the characteristics of bilingual education, countries with the most successful experience in this field in the world were identified. Such countries were Singapore and Finland.

The methodological basis for adapting the phenomenon under study was its understanding as the possibility of applying the experience of these two countries without loss of authenticity. In addition, to adapt the experience of others, contextual interpretation and comparative analysis according to certain indicators are necessary, which makes it possible to identify the most appropriate fragment of the experience being adapted. A comparative analysis in the context of the problem we are studying involves consideration of the characteristics of the mentality of the population of Singapore, Finland and Kazakhstan, the geographical, demographic and economic situation of these countries. As a result of this analysis, it was found that there are many clear and transferable methods and technologies in bilingual education in the three countries. In this sense, the basis for the success of schoolchildren in Finland and Singapore is their high level of motivation in learning languages: for Finnish schoolchildren this is expressed in relation to the Finnish language (it has the status of a state language), for Singaporeans - in relation to the English language. For the Kazakh situation of language immersion, these parallels are due to the fact that the state language is the Kazakh language: here the Finns, unlike the Kazakhs, have high motivation. Regarding the English language: the situation here is similar to the motivation of schoolchildren in Singapore.

A comparative analysis showed that the use of the Motivated Strategies for Learning Questionnaire (MSLQ), consisting of two blocks, the first of which assesses the motivation of schoolchildren according to 31 criteria, distributed across six subscales, is fully effective as a fragment for adapting the experience of these countries. according to 50 criteria, grouped into two components.

Thus, pedagogical strategies for adapting the best world experience of bilingual education to the conditions of the Kazakhstan education system are:

- development of criteria for assessing the best world experience;
- according to these criteria there were identified countries with the most successful experience in bilingual education;
- establishing the correlation of the identified successful foreign experience with the Kazakh practice of bilingual education;
- selection of one or several fragments of such experience that have the greatest opportunities for its adaptation to the conditions of Kazakhstan.

As pedagogical mechanisms, which we understand as a set of elements that determine the order of carrying out pedagogical activities, we propose:

- a program for developing schoolchildren's motivation in learning languages, compiled taking into account the criteria of the MSLQ questionnaire;

- training methodological seminars for teachers on the application of the successful experience of Singapore and Finland in matters of bilingual education of schoolchildren.

Practical verification of the developed pedagogical strategies and mechanisms for adapting the desired phenomenon, carried out within the framework of a local experiment, substantiates their consistency and positive results.

**Experimental research base:** “Comprehensive school No. 82”, in Karaganda.

**The main stages of the research:**

*The first stage of the research* (October 2018 - August 2019): searching, collection and systematization of scientific materials on the problem under the study, development of scientific apparatus, study and identification of the best world experience in bilingual education, determination of the essence of methodological support for adapting the best world experience of bilingual education.

*The second stage of the study* (September 2019 – December 2020) is the practical verification of pedagogical strategies and mechanisms for adapting the phenomenon under study, organizing and conducting experimental pedagogical work on the problem under study.

*The third stage of the study* (from January 2021) is the processing and interpretation of the obtained data, the formulation of conclusions and generalization of the study results, as well as the editorial design of the dissertation material.

**Approbation of the research results:** a total of 11 works were published, 1 scientific article in the journal in the SCOPUS DB, 1 scientific article in the Web of Science DB journal, 8 articles in scientific publications recommended by the CQASES MS HE RK, 1 article in the proceedings of international conferences (Appendix 1).

**Structure and scope of the dissertation.**

The dissertation consists of an introduction, two sections, a conclusion, a list of used sources (161 titles), 2 appendixes.