

Review
of the dissertation titled
“Technology of creating foreign language multimedia educational tutorials
based on authentic audio- and videomaterials
(on the example of pre-service foreign language teachers training)”
by Smagulova Gulnur Zhumartovna
submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph. D.),
in specialty 6D011900 – “Foreign language: two foreign languages”

№	Criteria	Compliance with the criteria (one of the answer options should be marked)	Substantiation of the official reviewer' position
	The topic of the dissertation (on the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of science development of and / or state programs	<p>1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs:</p> <p>1) The dissertation was completed within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (indicate the name and number of the project or program)</p> <p>2) The dissertation was completed within the framework of another state program (indicate the name of the program)</p> <p>3) corresponds to the priority direction of pedagogical science development, approved by the Higher Scientific - Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (indicate the direction)</p>	<p>1.1 The dissertation research is devoted to the topical problem of pedagogical science and practice.</p> <p>The topic of the dissertation corresponds to the priorities of science development and state programs. The main sources of the research were regulatory documents and legislative acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan: the Law “On Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan”, the State General Education Standard, the State Program “Digital Kazakhstan”, the State Program of the Development of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025.</p> <p>One of the important directions of education development in the context of informatization and digitalization, as can be traced from the documents defining the new educational policy, is to increase digital literacy at all levels of education, provide online access to electronic educational materials, the need to create digital educational content, provide conditions for teachers' digital competence development and increase of their qualifications taking into account the modern requirements of the digital reality, the implementation of educational programs for the training of teaching staff in order to introduce relevant teaching methods. Thus, the present dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of the development of pedagogy as a science.</p>
	Scientific significance	The work makes / does not make a significant contribution to the science, and its importance is well disclosed / not disclosed	The work makes a significant contribution to the science, its importance is disclosed well enough. The doctoral student identified the theoretical foundations of the technology of creating foreign language multimedia educational tutorials based on

			<p>authentic audio- and videomaterials; the concept of “multimedia textbook” has been clarified, and the methodical system has been developed aimed at training pre-service foreign language teachers to create multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials as a means of transmitting the real language and cultural environment of the country of the target language while designing an information-subject learning environment.</p>
		<p>Independence level: 1) high; 2) medium; 3) low; 4) there is no independence.</p>	<p>The level of independence of the dissertation research performance is high. The doctoral student demonstrated the ability to analyze theoretical sources, draw conclusions and generalizations in accordance with the topic and the goal and objectives on the basis of the analysis made, justify each position submitted for the defense, conduct a quantitative and qualitative analysis of the study results.</p>
	<p>The principle of internal unity</p>	<p>4.1 The relevance of the dissertation is substantiated: 1) substantiated; 2) partially substantiated; 3) is not substantiated.</p>	<p>4.1 The relevance of Smagulova Gulnur Zhumartovna’s dissertation is substantiated. The doctoral student, having identified contradictions, namely between:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>the need to create relevant digital content for Foreign Language Teaching</i> in the form of multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials as a means of broadcasting the real language and cultural environment of the target country, dynamically representing the realities of a foreign language culture when designing an information-subject learning environment, and <i>a real level theoretical and practical developments</i> in the field of Information Technologies providing teachers with the opportunity to independently use software tools to develop foreign language multimedia educational tutorials that implement the didactic capabilities of authentic audio- and videomaterials; - <i>between the current practice of pre-service foreign language training</i> which does not adequately ensure the formation of their relevant skills of creating foreign language multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials, and <i>the capabilities of modern information technologies</i> that allow them to independently implement the technical

			support of the process of developing and designing digital multimedia educational resources, highlighted the relevance of the present research.
		4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the topic of the dissertation: 1) reflects; 2) partially reflects; 3) does not reflect	4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the stated research topic. The doctoral dissertation consists of an introduction, two sections, a conclusion, a list of references, and five appendices.
		4.3 The aim and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation: 1) correspond; 2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond	4.3 The aim and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation. The aim of the present research is to provide is to provide a scientific justification and practical elaboration of the technology creating foreign language multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and video materials. Research objectives systematically implement the sequence of decisions necessary to achieve the aim set.
		4.4 All sections and provisions of the dissertation are logically interconnected: 1) are fully interconnected; 2) the relationship is partial;	4.4 All sections and provisions of the dissertation are logically interconnected. Sections of the dissertation correspond to the objectives set. The main provisions submitted for defense are fully consistent with the topic, problem, aim, and objectives of the dissertation research; the logic of presentation confirms the completeness of the interconnection of all sections, conclusions, and provisions of the dissertation.
		4.5 New solutions proposed by the author (principles, methods) are justified and evaluated in comparison with known solutions: 1) there is a critical analysis; 2) partial analysis; 3) the analysis does not present the author's own position, but provides quotations from other authors.	4.5 The author's scientific justification of the development of the technology creating foreign language multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and video materials, the clarified concept of "multimedia educational tutorial", the methodical system aimed at training pre-service foreign language teachers to create multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials are presented from the point of view of a critical analysis of psychological -pedagogical literature on the research topic. Based on this analysis, the author presents evidence-based ways to solve the problem identified.
	The principle of scientific novelty	5.1 Are scientific results and statements new? 1) completely new;	5.1 Scientific results and provisions are new and partially new. Research result 1 is partly new. Based on the analysis of the literature on the research topic,

	<p>2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new);</p>	<p>the concept of “multimedia educational tutorial” has been clarified, its essential characteristics have been determined; Research result 2 is partly new. Based on the analysis of methodological and scientific literature, an algorithm of the methodical processing of authentic audio- and videomaterials as the digital educational content is considered and substantiated to integrate them into the environment of a foreign language multimedia tutorial. Research result 3 is new. The author has developed a technology of creating multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials, based on the existing theories of creating electronic educational resources, presented its methodological foundations, provided and disclosed substantiation of its definition and essence as a system of notions, actions and procedures, built in accordance with the principles and requirements for the process of developing these multimedia tutorials, including theoretical and technical aspects of their creation. Research result 4 is new. The author has developed and tested a methodical system aimed at training pre-service foreign language teachers to create multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials, consisting of interrelated components that ensure that in their unity they achieve the sufficient (heuristic) and high (professional) levels of readiness for this type of activity which involves their acquisition of deep knowledge and competencies in the specified area. Research result 5 is new. Approbation of the methodical system aimed at training pre-service foreign language teachers to create multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials allowed most students to achieve a sufficient level of readiness in this area and implement a systematic approach to creating multimedia educational tutorials in terms of Pedagogy, Methods of Teaching, Psychology, Ergonomics.</p>
	<p>5.2 Are the conclusions of the dissertation new? 1) completely new;</p>	<p>5.2 The conclusions of the dissertation are completely new. The content of each conclusion is determined not only by the</p>

	<p>2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p> <p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and justified: 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>	<p>scientific search for a solution to the tasks set, but also by the author's own position on solving the problem of dissertation research.</p> <p>5.3 Technological solutions are new and justified, that is evidenced by the development and consistent introduction of a module of lectures and practical tasks within the elective discipline "Innovative technologies in the organization of the educational process at school", an electronic educational tutorial "Fundamentals of developing multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials", and a MOOC on the corresponding topic on the platform of the Karaganda University named after academician E.A. Buketov into the pedagogical process.</p>
Validity of the main conclusions	All key findings are/are not based on scientifically sound evidence or are reasonably well-founded (for qualitative research and arts and humanities courses)	6. All the main conclusions presented by the author are quite well substantiated, which is due to a reasoned choice of methodological positions, organization and conduct of experimental - pedagogical work followed with the results of its effectiveness, a set of selected scientific research methods necessary to obtain objective data, as well as the implementation of all requirements to be met by scientific pedagogical research.
The main provisions submitted for the defense	<p>The following questions should be answered for each position separately:</p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven? 1) proven; 2) rather proven; 3) rather not proven; 4) not proven.</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial? 1) yes; 2) no;</p> <p>7.3 Is it new? 1) yes; 2) no.</p> <p>7.4 Level of application: 1) narrow; 2) medium; 3) wide.</p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the articles?</p>	<p>7.1 The provisions submitted for defense are fully proven. Evidence is provided by the initial theoretical positions of the researcher, sufficient duration and regularity of the work, the consistency of the scientific apparatus of the research, the implementation of a set of methods of scientific and pedagogical research, and the qualitative and quantitative analysis of the experimental data.</p> <p>7.2 The provisions are not trivial as they are scientifically new.</p> <p>7.3 The provisions submitted for the defense are new.</p> <p>7.4 Level of provisions for application is medium. The results of the study can be used in the process of creation of foreign language multimedia educational tutorials, as well as in the practice of training teachers in this field.</p> <p>7.5 Provisions of the dissertation are proven in the articles. The main provisions and conclusions of the dissertation research were</p>

			reflected in publications, including articles in scientific editions recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 1 article in foreign scientific journals indexed in Scopus database, 4 articles in the collections of materials of international scientific - practical conferences.
The principle of reliability. Reliability of sources and information provided	8.1 Choice of methodology is justified or methodology is described in sufficient detail	8.1 Yes, the choice of methodology is justified, described in sufficient detail, and determines the validity of the results of the research. Fundamental psychological - pedagogical theories and concepts, methodological approaches, which served as the basis for theoretical research and experimental work are disclosed.	
	8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing, interpreting data using the computer technology:	8.2 Yes, to solve the aim and objectives of the research and to confirm the research hypothesis, the following groups of methods were used: - theoretical: study and system analysis of psychological, pedagogical, scientific, scientific - methodological literature; analysis of normative and educational documentation, methods of comparison and modelling; - empirical: diagnostic questioning, testing, pedagogical experiment; - mathematical statistics methods: Student's t-test, Pearson's correlation coefficient with data processing in MS Excel.	
	8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns are proven and confirmed by the experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results are proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment):	8.3 Theoretical conclusions, assumptions, identified relationships and patterns are proven and confirmed by the experimental research: - a set of principles of creating multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials is substantiated; - didactic, methodological, psychological - pedagogical, technical - technological requirements for the creation of multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials have been identified and systematized; - the technology of creating multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials is substantiated; - a methodological system aimed at training pre-service foreign language teachers to create multimedia educational tutorials based	

			<p>on authentic audio- and videomaterials has been developed.</p> <p>The results are proven based on a pedagogical experiment.</p>
		8.4 Important statements are confirmed / partially confirmed / not confirmed by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature	8.4 The author supports important statements with references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.
		8.5 The sources of literature used are sufficient / not sufficient for a literature review.	8.5 The literature sources used are sufficient for a literature review. The list of sources used is consists of 307 items, including legislative and regulatory documents, foreign and domestic scientists' works.
The principle of practical value	9.1 The dissertation has a high theoretical value:	9.1 Yes, the dissertation has a theoretical value, which is determined by the contribution to the development of the theory and practice of creating foreign language multimedia educational products. The author presents the scientific justification for the creation of technology of creating multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials considering the specifics of the subject "Foreign Language", as well as methodological approaches to organization of pre-service foreign language teachers' training in this field.	
	9.2 The dissertation is of practical importance and there is a high probability of applying the results obtained in practice:	9.2 The dissertation work is of practical importance and there is a high probability of applying the results obtained in practice. An electronic tutorial and a MOOC within the research scope have been developed and introduced into the educational process.	
	9.3 Are the suggestions for the practice new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	9.3 The developed technology of creating multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials suggested by the author is a new proposal for the practice.	
Quality of writing and design	Quality of academic writing: 1) high; 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low	10. The dissertation is distinguished by a competent scientific style of presentation, high quality of academic writing, since the dissertation research is done in accordance with the requirements for the structure of the text and its design; the author applies argumentation and interpretation, uses a scientific style of presentation.	

Positively evaluating the results of the dissertation research conducted by Smagulova Gulnur Zhumartovna, we suggest some recommendations:

1. The research focuses on pre-service foreign language teachers' achievement of a sufficient (heuristic) level of readiness in the field of creating multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials, while it might be necessary to strive to achieve a high (professional) level of their readiness in this area.

2. There are some stylistic and punctuation flaws in the text of the dissertation.

It should be noted that the above remarks are mostly of a formal character and do not reduce the significance of the research carried out and the results obtained, presented in the dissertation work. It should be noted that the above remarks are mostly formal in nature and do not reduce the significance of the research carried out and its results obtained and presented in the dissertation.

Dissertation research by Smagulova Gulnur Zhumartovna titled "Technology of creating foreign language multimedia educational tutorials based on authentic audio- and videomaterials (on the example of pre-service foreign language teachers training)" submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) in the specialty 6D011900 – "Foreign Language: two foreign languages" is of great theoretical and practical importance.

The presented research is a holistic, relevant, independent and complete piece of work and meets the requirements for a dissertation submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) in the specialty 6D011900 – "Foreign language: two foreign languages".

In this regard, we confirm that a doctoral student Smagulova Gulnur Zhumartovna deserves awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) in the specialty 6D011900 – "Foreign language: two foreign languages".

Official reviewer:

**Candidate of Ped. Sc., Associate Professor
of the Department of Theory and Practice
of Foreign Languages,
L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian national
University,
Astana**



Zhussupova R.F.

